



# **Institutional Review of Higher Education Institutions in Albania**

**Report of University College  
"Wisdom"  
June 2017**

REVIEW TEAM:

- 1 Mr Grant Horsburgh Lead Reviewer
- 2 Professor. Juliana Latifi Reviewer
- 3 Mr Kevin Kendall Reviewer



Kevin Kendall

## Contents

About this review.....	1
The context of this review .....	2
Summary report .....	3
Summary of findings .....	5
Detailed report .....	7
Evaluation Area 1: The Organisation and its Management.....	7
Evaluation Area 2: Resourcing.....	10
Evaluation Area 3: The Curriculum.....	14
Evaluation Area 4: Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research .....	17
Evaluation Area 5: Students and their Support.....	20
Evidence list.....	22

## About this review

The overall aim of Institutional Review is to assess the extent to which each higher education institution (HEI) meets the Albanian State Quality Standards which came into force in 2011. Institutional Review is a peer-review process with each review team composed of a mix of UK reviewers appointed by QAA and Albanian reviewers appointed by APAAL. The review team is led by a QAA reviewer.

The resulting reports will serve not only for institutional accreditation based on the extent to which the HEI meets the standards, but will also to inform the HEIs, Albanian government, the public and students of how each HEI meets the standards. This report also helps the HEI to identify priorities for enhancement (the process by which higher education providers systematically improve the quality of provision and the ways in which students' learning is supported).

The Albanian State Quality Standards have been grouped under five headings, the Evaluation Areas: The Organisation and its Management; Resourcing; the Curriculum; Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research; and Students and their Support. This report identifies features of good practice, recommendations, affirmations of actions in progress and weaknesses for each Evaluation Area, together with a judgement as to how well the HEI meets the standards. The judgements that the reviewers may assign are: standards are fully met; standards are substantially met; standards are partly met; or standards are not met.

Finally, the reviewers conclude by recommending a summary judgement to APAAL's Accreditation Council. This overall judgement is one of four levels:

- **State Quality Standards are met**
- **State Quality Standards are substantially met**
- **State Quality Standards are partly met**
- **State Quality Standards are not met.**

As part of the report-writing process, QAA has provided expert support to the review team by ensuring that the team supports the findings made in the report with evidence, and also by proofreading and summarising the full report for the summary below.

## **The context of this review**

University College 'Wisdom' is a non-public higher education institution which offers first and second-cycle levels of study in the subject areas of law, economics and social sciences. The University was granted its current title by the Council of Ministers in 2008 having been licensed initially in 2006.

At the time of this review, the University consisted of two main units and four departments: the Faculty of Law, comprising the Department of Public Law and the Department of Private Law, and the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences, comprising the Department of Psychology and the Department of Economics. In addition, each faculty has a Scientific Research and Foreign Affairs Unit and there are 10 administrative units. The University employs 42 full-time and four part-time academic teaching staff and offers four first-cycle (bachelor's) and three second-cycle (Master of Science) programmes of study. There are 261 undergraduate students and 141 Master of Science students enrolled on the University's programmes. **[HEI info on APAAL site]**

## Summary report

University College Wisdom is a non-public higher education institution which has been operating in its current form since 2008. At the time of this review, the University has approximately 400 students and offers four first-cycle (bachelor's) and three second-cycle (Master of Science) programmes of study. The University has 10 full-time and one part-time academic teaching staff organised into two main units: the Faculty of Law, comprising the Department of Public Law and the Department of Private Law, and the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences, comprising the Department of Psychology and the Department of Economics.

A self-evaluation report (SER) was developed by an institutional team that included senior managers, academic and support staff and a student representative. Drafts were circulated to a wider audience within the University before being finalised and approved by the Rectorate and Academic Senate.

The visit took place over two days on the 15 and 16 June 2017. The review team was made up of two senior higher education reviewers from the United Kingdom and one experienced higher education member of staff from an Albanian institution. The review team was supported by the Review Manager and a note-taker provided by the Albanian Public Accreditation Agency for Higher Education (APAAL). The review team received a self-evaluation report and the portfolio of supporting evidence eight weeks in advance of the review visit, later supplemented by additional requested documentation before and during the visit. A wide range of supporting information provided by the University enabled the team to familiarise themselves with the structure, policies, management procedures and nature of teaching and research activity undertaken. Evidence included the Statute and regulations, the annual report to the Ministry, internal monitoring and evaluation reports, admission and orientation procedures, a list of external agreements and memoranda, examples of programme information and evidence of deliberative meetings.

The review team met with senior managers, the self-evaluation team, students, lecturers, administrative and support staff, as well as external partners and alumni during the review visit. Discussion supported the clarification of procedures, responsibilities and viewpoints. Notes were taken at all meetings. As part of a tour of the main campus the review team viewed the library, teaching areas, laboratories, sports facilities and offices.

The Standards for the Organisation and its Management are substantially met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice and the review team did not affirm any actions already in progress. However, the review team has made one recommendation for the University to consider as a means of further securing the quality and standard of its programmes and of further enhancing the learning experience of its students. The lack of international partnership cooperation that leads to mobility opportunities for staff and students is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University continues to establish and implement international partnership cooperation as a means of facilitating mobility opportunities for staff and students (**Chapter III, Standard III.4**).

The Standards for Resourcing are substantially met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice and the review team did not affirm any actions already in progress. However, the review team has made three recommendations for the University to consider as a means of further securing the quality and standard of its programmes and of further enhancing the learning experience of its students. The absence of a coordinated personal password-protected information system (virtual learning environment) is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (**Chapter III,**

**Standard VII.1).** The inadequate facilities for students with disabilities is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (**Chapter I Standard VI.3**). The lack of hard copy books in the library is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University reviews the stock of hard copy books in the library to ensure that this meets the teaching and learning needs of students and staff (**Chapter III Standard V.2**).

The Standards for the Curriculum are substantially met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice and the review team did not affirm any actions already in progress. However, the review team has made one recommendation for the University to consider as a means of further securing the quality and standard of its programmes and of further enhancing the learning experience of its students. The lack of input into curriculum development by external stakeholders is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University reviews the way in which it facilitates input from external stakeholders on curriculum development to assist employment opportunities for students (**Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12**).

The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are substantially met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice and the review team did not affirm any actions already in progress. However, the review team has made three recommendations for the University to consider as a means of further securing the quality and standard of its programmes and of further enhancing the learning experience of its students. The absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University develops and implements a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (**Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5**). The absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University ensures that departments take responsibility for promoting, coordinating and managing the scientific research work of established research groups (**Chapter II Standard I.1**). The absence of research activity with a partner engagement with European bids in the field of scientific research is a weakness, and it is recommended that the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that its research internationalisation agenda has a clear focus on engaging with European bids in the field of scientific research, and research cooperation with foreign higher education institutions more generally (**Chapter II Standard I.3**).

The Standards for Students and their Support are fully met. In reaching this judgement, the review team did not record any features of good practice or identify any weaknesses, and did not affirm any actions already in progress. The institutional structures for student orientation and support work in accordance with the Statute and regulations. There are in place appropriate supportive policies and processes to assist students in finding employment.

University College Wisdom undertook the review in accordance with APAAL guidelines. The review team acknowledges the University's engagement with the process and the cooperation provided to the review team throughout the visit phase.

## Summary of findings

### Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the lack of international partnership cooperation that leads to mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 1.10; **Chapter III Standard III.4**)
- the absence of a coordinated personal password-protected information system (virtual learning environment) (paragraph 2.7; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the inadequate facilities for students with physical disabilities (paragraph 2.9; **Chapter I Standard VI.3**)
- the lack of hard copy books in the library (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard V.1**)
- the lack of formal input into curriculum development by external stakeholders (paragraph 3.9; **Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12**)
- the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments (paragraph 4.6; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)
- the absence of research activity with a partner, and no engagement with European bids in the field of scientific research (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.3**).

### Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- continue to establish and implement international partnership cooperation as a means of facilitating mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 1.10; **Chapter III Standard III.4**)
- investigate and install appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (paragraph 2.7; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- as a matter of urgency, develop and implement a defined plan to ensure that physically disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (paragraph 2.9; **Chapter I Standard VI.3**)
- as a matter of urgency, review the stock of hard copy books in the library to ensure that this meets the teaching and learning needs of students and staff (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard V.1**)
- as a matter of urgency, review the way in which the University facilitates input from external stakeholders on curriculum development to assist employment opportunities for students (paragraph 3.9; **Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12**)
- as a matter of urgency, develop and implement a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- as a matter of urgency, ensure that departments take responsibility for promoting, coordinating and managing the scientific research work of established research groups (paragraph 4.6; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)



- develop and implement a defined plan to ensure that the University research internationalisation agenda has a clear focus on engaging with European bids in the field of scientific research, and research cooperation with foreign higher education institutions more generally (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.3**).

### **Affirmation of action being taken**

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

### **Summary of judgements for each Evaluation Area**

- 1 The Standards for the Organisation and its Management are **substantially met**.
- 2 The Standards for Resourcing are **substantially met**.
- 3 The Standards for the Curriculum are **substantially met**.
- 4 The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are **substantially met**.
- 5 The Standards for Students and their Support are **fully met**.

### **Summary judgement**

The reviewers recommend to the Accreditation Council that at Wisdom College, the State Quality Standards are **substantially met**.

## Detailed report

### Evaluation Area 1: The Organisation and its Management

1.1 The University's governance and regulatory frameworks are designed to align with national legal requirements for higher education institutions. **[SER p.6]** The Statute sets out the mission, internal organisation and management structures. **[A1]** Individual and formal board and council responsibilities are also defined in the University's regulations. **[A10]** The University amends and changes its Statute and regulations as required. **[B3-B5]** A revised Statute has been developed to take account of the new higher education law and the change in status of the Institution to become a University College, and is currently with the Ministry for approval. **[M3-M5]** **[Chapter III Standard I.1]**

1.2 The Institution is organised to secure management efficiency in accordance with Ministry requirements. **[SER p.6-8; A1; A10]** The flow of information from departments to Senate, and the promulgation of decisions made by Senate to staff and students, is effective. **[SER p.6-8; B2-B5; M2-M5; M10; M11]** Arrangements for the management and administration of the Institution, and for collegial decision making, take account of legal expectations, work appropriately and are understood by staff at all levels. **[SER p.6-8; M2-M5; M10; M11]** **[Chapter III Standard I.2]**

1.3 Boards and councils meet regularly and information on agenda items is made available to all staff in advance electronically. **[SER p.8; B2-B5; M2-M5; M10; M11]** Formally constituted boards and committees, and internal processes and procedures, are in the first year of operation and should be monitored and evaluated to confirm their effectiveness. **[M4; M5; M11]** However, students and staff indicated that matters raised by them are given due consideration through constructive debate by boards and councils. Arrangements for the operation of deliberative councils and boards, and to support collegial discussion and debate, are understood by staff and students. **[M2-M6; M10; M11]** Deans and heads of department are responsible for monitoring locally the implementation of decisions made by the Institution's boards and councils. **[M2-M5; M10; M11]** **[Chapter III Standard I.3; Chapter III Standard II.3]**

1.4 The Institution ensures that the limits of its autonomy are respected and that it operates within the confines of prevailing laws and regulations. **[SER p.9-10]** Self-governance is evident in organisational academic and administrative units, teaching and scientific activities, financial and administrative matters. **[A11-A19; B2-B5; M2-M5; M10; M11]** The Internal Unit of Quality Assurance reports to Senate and has operational autonomy to supervise internal monitoring and evaluation activities. **[SER p.9; A16; A17; A19; M3-M5; M11]** The Office of Scientific Research and Foreign Relations has applied with a partner organisation for Erasmus+ funding and has engaged external experts to support institutional activities. Examples include Ministry of Law representatives providing guest lectures on European law, government archivists providing practical research skills training, and practising lawyers suggesting changes to the curriculum to ensure currency. **[SER p.10; A38; A41-A43; M3-M5; M11]** **[Chapter III Standard I.4]**

1.5 The Institution has an appropriate development strategy for the period 2016-2020, which has been approved by Senate. **[SER p.10; A18; C7]** The strategy has been drafted in accordance with the Institution mission and objectives and was considered during various stages of its development by management bodies and councils. **[SER p.10; B2-B5; M3; M4; M11]** **[Chapter III Standard I.5]**

1.6 The annual report to the Ministry of Education and Sport provides accounts of teaching and study programmes, scientific research, staffing, project activity and economic and financial matters. **[SER p.10-11; B12]** The drafting process is informed by internal

evaluation and self-assessment reports on department and study programme activities. The final report is approved by Senate at a meeting which is open to all staff and students. **[SER p.11; M3; M4; M6; M11] [Chapter III Standard I.6]**

1.7 Faculties and departments are organised in accordance with legal requirements. Management, executive, and administrative structures are separate from academic structures and organisational units. Academic staff are qualified appropriately, with seven of the 10 staff holding doctoral-level qualifications, and exercise autonomy and academic freedom in teaching, research and all other academic activities. The Institution has an official website and offers first and second-cycle programmes. **[SER p11-12; B11; HEI info on APAAL site; M2-M4; M10; M11] [Chapter III Standard II.1]**

1.8 The Institution has a network of partners at national and regional level, which includes higher education institutions, public bodies and businesses. **[SER p12-13; A41-A43]** Academic staff, alumni and placement providers indicated that there are strong links between local and regional organisations, and departments and programmes. Academic staff liaise closely with such organisations to provide student placement and employment opportunities and to ensure that the curriculum remains current. This, and market research undertaken at institutional level, enables faculties, departments and programmes to be informed appropriately on regional economic development opportunities. Recent market research undertaken has focused on the potential future demand for qualified marketing managers, lawyers and psychologists, particularly in the public sector. The Institution uses this information to ensure that students are provided with appropriate skills to gain employment in such sectors. **[SER p12-13; A25-A27; B14; M3; M4; M6; M10 M11] [Chapter III Standard III.1; Chapter III Standard III.2]**

1.9 The Office of Scientific Research and Foreign Relations oversees the development of collaboration arrangements with overseas partners, while department offices maintain oversight of local and regional collaborations. **[SER p13-14; A35; A38; M4; M11]** Similarly, collaboration with other organisations to provide students with professional practice opportunities is managed at department level. **[Chapter III Standard III.3]**

1.10 The Institution has established a number of formal agreements to enable staff and students to participate in international activities in Austria, Crete, Greece, Italy, Kosovo and Macedonia. **[SER p.15-16; A35; A38]** While agreements have been established, international partnership cooperation and take-up of mobility opportunities for staff and students is acknowledged as being low, and an area for further development, by senior staff. **[SER p.16; M2-M5]** The review team identified as a **weakness** the lack of international partnership cooperation that leads to mobility opportunities for staff and students. The team **recommends** that the University continues to establish and implement international partnership cooperation as a means of facilitating mobility opportunities for staff and students. See also paragraph 3.6. **[Chapter III Standard III.4]**

## **Findings**

### **Good practice**

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### **Weaknesses**

The review team identified the following weakness:

- the lack of international partnership cooperation that leads to mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 1.10; ***Chapter III Standard III.4***).

### **Recommendations**

The review team identified the following recommendation:

- continue to establish and implement international partnership cooperation as a means of facilitating mobility opportunities for staff and students (paragraph 1.10; ***Chapter III Standard III.4***).

### **Affirmation of action being taken**

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

## **Judgement**

**The Standards for the Organisation and its Management are substantially met.**

## Evaluation Area 2: Resourcing

2.1 The structure of the Institution is clearly described in the Statute and the regulations and a diagram showing this is published on the website, showing the distinction between the academic and administrative areas. [SER p.17-18; A1; A10; A49; B9; [http://www.wisdom.edu.al/pdf/Kolegji\\_Universitar\\_Wisdom\\_Organigrama.pdf](http://www.wisdom.edu.al/pdf/Kolegji_Universitar_Wisdom_Organigrama.pdf)]. Academic staff recruitment is based on merit and according to the specific criteria required. [SER p.17-18; A45; M4; M10] Academic Staff Recruitment Policy guides the recruitment process including the identification of need, advertising, selection for interview, interviewing and associated administrative procedures. [A45; B15] This is managed by the Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office which covers all aspects of human resource management, including retaining documentation and personal files of staff. [SER p.17; A55; A56] Staff demonstrated a familiarity with these processes during meetings with the review team. [M4; M10] Staff also stated that vacant positions are advertised on the website. [<http://www.wisdom.edu.al/post/njoftim-nga-zyra-e-burimeve-njerezore>] However, this has no further details than the job title and interested parties are asked to contact the Institution for more information. [Chapter III Standard IV.1; Chapter III Standard II.2]

2.2 The list of academic staff shows a full range of qualified staff across all faculties and departments. [A47] There are 42 full-time academic staff, four part-time academic staff and 19 administrative staff employed at the Institution, all having Albanian citizenship. [SER p.18; HEI info on APAAL site] The review team met two part-time members of academic staff who had been recruited because of specific qualifications and skills that they possess. [M10] However, it was noted in meetings that few academic staff had a working knowledge of the English language despite claims by the Institution that they give priority to those who have graduated from a Western university and know foreign languages. [SER p.17; M2-M5; M10; M11] Academic staff are appointed by the relevant dean and a contract is signed by the Administrator and the employee. [A48] The Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office keeps a full record of employment statistics. [A51] [Chapter III Standard IV.2]

2.3 The Institution integrates academic and administrative staff through organising joint activities, for example seminars, conferences, promotion activities, visits to high schools and social activities, and these were confirmed during meetings with staff. [SER p.18; M10] A calendar of some of the most notable activities in recent years has been published for information for staff and students and shows a wide range of academic activities that support integration. [A50] [Chapter III Standard IV.2]

2.4 The Institution pursues a policy of periodic assessment of staff skills according to its Statute and regulations. [SER p.18-19; A1; A10; B16] Academic staff evaluation uses evidence from student questionnaires completed at the end of every semester, reports from the Internal Quality Assurance Unit based on self-evaluation reports, lesson observations, and evaluation by the Head of Department. These are discussed with the teacher by the Head of Department at the end of the year. [SER p.18-19; B16; M3; M6; M10] Staff are expected to keep up to date with their subject during the time allocated to non-teaching activity in their annual plan. [M4; M10] The Institution collates and keeps a record of these staff evaluation activities to rectify deficiencies and inform promotion decisions. [A56-A58; M3; M6; M10] [Chapter III Standard IV.3]

2.5 The small size of the Institution, with 65 staff and approximately 400 students, helps to promote a close relationship between staff and students. [SER p.19; M2-M6; M10; M11] Activities arranged to facilitate and enable this relationship include festive dinners, lunches, birthday celebrations and promotional events. The University provides health and life insurance as required. [SER p.19; M2-M6; M10; M11; A52] [Chapter III Standard IV.4]

2.6 As a private self-financed institution, income is generated from students' tuition fees. [SER p.20; A1] The Chancellor is the chief administrative officer and is responsible for managing the financial and administrative activity of the Institution. [SER p.20; B17; M11] Departments initially present their proposals for the coming year, and these are collated at faculty level and the overall institutional budget is produced by the Chancellor. This is discussed by the Rectorate before final approval at the Board of Administration. [SER p.20; M11] Staff were generally of the view that finance is not a limiting factor, and they get the resources that they ask for. [M10] However, the Chancellor monitors the budget regularly and will stop departments overspending on the approved budget. [M11] The Chancellor is supported by the Finance Office, which keep records of all financial transactions. [A58; A59] The accounts must get Ministry approval but are not subject to an independent auditor, and are not published. [M11]. Financial management takes full account of statutory and legal requirements. [SER p.20-22] [Chapter III Standard VI.1; Chapter III Standard VI.2; Chapter III Standard VI.3]

2.7 The Institution has a website where it details the structure, procedures and activities plus brief summaries of the programmes offered. [SER p.22; <http://www.wisdom.edu.al>] Teaching staff communicate with students using the email system, and students stated that this was acceptable. [M6; M10] However, there is not a coordinated personal password-protected information system where students and staff can access confidential information, for example dedicated teaching and learning resources and students' grades. [M6; M10; M11] The review team considers the absence of a coordinated personal password-protected information system (virtual learning environment) to be a **weakness**. It **recommends** that the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and to dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme. [Chapter III Standard VII.1]

2.8 The space requirements for staff and students take full account of the standards required by the new law for higher education. [SER p.23-25; A66; Learning resource tour] In 2015, the Institution commissioned a technical report on buildings which does not appear to highlight any issues for action by the Institution. [C8] The infrastructure comprises three buildings, two on the main site and one some distance away. On the main site, there is an administration building and a larger building where teaching and learning activities take place. [Learning resource tour] The main building contains 15 teaching classrooms, a conference room, a computer room, a small library and a number of offices. There is also a café and social area for use by staff and students. [Learning resource tour] The Institution contracts with other organisations for the use of sports facilities, and the students commented that this is working well. [A115; M6] The computer room has 12 computers and a number of laptops are available in the library. Most classrooms do not have fitted projectors or laptops and portable devices have to be taken there when needed. [Learning resource tour] Wi-Fi is available throughout the building and many students use their own portable devices. [M6] Newer technology, for example interactive whiteboards, is not evident, and the team noticed some potentially dangerous wiring on two air conditioning units in classrooms. [Learning resource tour]. Staff and students are of the view that the information technology resources provided are satisfactory and they had no wish to update them. [M6; M10] [Chapter III Standard VII.2; Chapter III Standard VII.3; Chapter III Standard VII.5; Chapter III Standard V1]

2.9 The main student building is over five floors, and the existing lift is unsuitable for individuals with a physical disability due to it being too narrow for wheelchair access. In addition, the lift does not provide access to the fifth floor, where several teaching and learning rooms, including the library, are situated. [Learning resource tour] The review team found the inadequate facilities for students with physical disabilities to be a **weakness**. The team **recommends** that as a matter of urgency, the University develops and

implements a defined plan to ensure that students with a physical disability can access all learning and teaching facilities. **[Chapter III Standard V.1]**

2.10 The Institution provides storage, in both electronic and hard copy form, of all relevant documentation relating to students, staff, infrastructure, policies and procedures. **[SER p.23-24]** This is available through the Secretary's Office. **[M11] [Chapter III Standard VII.4]**

2.11 The library has 860 books covering 300 titles, and students are able to borrow these on a 20-day loan basis. **[Learning resource tour]** Students also have access to approximately 10,000 online titles, which are available through mobile devices both on site and remotely. **[Learning resource tour]** Students value this online resource but both staff and students are critical of the lack of hard copy books in the library to support their learning. **[M6; M10]** The review team considers the lack of hard copy books in the library to be a **weakness**. The team **recommends** that as a matter of urgency, the University reviews the stock of hard copy books in the library to ensure that this meets the teaching and learning needs of students and staff. **[Chapter III Standard V.1]**

## Findings

### Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the absence of a coordinated personal password-protected information system (virtual learning environment) (paragraph 2.7; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- the inadequate facilities for students with physical disabilities (paragraph 2.9; **Chapter I Standard VI.3**)
- the lack of hard copy books in the library (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard V.1**).

### Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- the University investigates and installs appropriate software to enable access to personal information and dedicated teaching and learning resources appropriate to each programme being studied (paragraph 2.7; **Chapter III Standard VII.1**)
- as a matter of urgency, the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that physically disabled students can access all learning and teaching facilities (paragraph 2.9; **Chapter I Standard VI.3**)
- as a matter of urgency, the University reviews the stock of hard copy books in the library to ensure this meets the teaching and learning needs of students and staff (paragraph 2.11; **Chapter III Standard V.1**).

### Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

### Judgement

**The Standards for Resourcing are substantially met.**



## Evaluation Area 3: The Curriculum

3.1 The Institution lists and describes the programmes on offer on its website. [SER p.27; A70; <http://wisdom.edu.al>] However, although the programme specifications are available on request they are not accessible through the website. [A77; Web docs 1-3] More information for students on programmes and the Institution is published in the student guide which gives details on, for example, all the programmes offered, facilities and location of the Institution and registration and graduation requirements. [A71] Programmes are organised in modules and use the European Credit Transfer System, where the first-cycle bachelor's programmes are 180 credits delivered over three years and the second-cycle master's programmes are 120 credits delivered over two years. [SER p.27; A76-A78; M3-M5; M10] [Chapter I Standard I.1]

3.2 The Institution keeps in contact with high schools and attends information days to inform potential students about the programmes. [SER p.27; M3-M5; M10] Students stated that the information given to them pre-entry was complete and accurate, and they found the website helpful. [M6] The Student Survey also reported that 100 per cent of students are satisfied with the pre-course information provided. [Student Survey] Student admission and registration is described in Article 56 and 57 of the Statute, including entry and transfer requirements. [SER p.27; A1] These are also repeated in more detail in the regulations. [A10] Students stated that the admissions and registration process went smoothly, and on arrival at the Institution they were given relevant information and made to feel welcome. [M6] Scholarships are available to students in defined categories, for example students with excellent high school grades, social criteria indicating financial hardship, or a second family member attending can get a discount. [A73; M11] [Chapter I Standard I.1]

3.3 The Institution does not offer part-time study programmes or short courses for professional updating. [SER p.28] However, it does endeavour to ensure that the full-time study programmes delivered meet the needs of its students. [SER p.28; M3-M5; M11] It does this through student questionnaires at the end of each semester, which include basic questions on the quality of the lecturers and lectures, the infrastructure and the subjects. The questions are largely closed questions and there is limited opportunity to comment on the programme aims and outcomes. [A72] [Chapter I Standard I.2]

3.4 The programmes offered are in accordance with the Institution's development strategy. [SER p.28-29; A21; M2-M5] The Strategic Development Plan (2012-2017) states that the University's mission is to establish, develop, promote, consolidate and protect a wide and appropriate knowledge base. This would serve of the country through teaching, research and other services in law, economics and society in compliance with social and economic developments in the country. [A18] [Chapter I Standard I.3]

3.5 Study programmes are primarily aimed at the needs of the Albanian labour market [A1] but there is a requirement for students seeking entry to second-cycle programmes to have a minimum knowledge compatible with internationally recognised norms. [SER p.29; A1; A10; M10] The Institution has agreements with several foreign institutions, and staff are encouraged to participate in international conferences. [A35, A36, A38, A50 & A1126] However, the Student and Staff Surveys reported that 89.47 per cent of students have not studied abroad and 91.18 per cent of staff have not worked abroad in the last five years. [Student Survey; Staff Survey] In addition, none of the students or staff met by the review team had been supported by the Institution to travel abroad in the current academic year. [M6; M10] As noted in paragraph 1.10, the lack of international partnership cooperation that leads to mobility opportunities for staff and students has been identified as a **weakness**. [Chapter I Standard I.4]

3.6 Academic staff workload is planned in advance in accordance with the relevant requirements. **[SER p.30]** Full-time teaching staff are expected to teach between six and 12 hours per week according to their contract, the remainder of their time being for research and other related activity. **[SER p.30; A75; A76; M10]** Teaching activities include lectures, seminars, assessments and professional practice and are approved by heads of department. The four members of part-time teaching staff teach fewer hours but add specialist expertise where required. **[SER p.30; A10; M4; M10]** **[Chapter I Standard I.5]**

3.7 Study programmes offered are easily understandable, clearly defined and accessible by students. **[SER p.30&31; Web docs 1-3]** Admissions criteria are set out clearly in the Statute and regulations. **[A1; A10]** Students confirmed that they fully understood the admissions criteria and aims and objectives of the programme they were studying. **[M6]** **[Chapter I Standard I.6]**

3.8 Curriculum development on existing programmes evolves on an annual basis through proposals from the academic staff, which go firstly to heads of department and deans, and then to the Senate for approval. **[SER p.29-32; M4; M10]** These developments are initiated by responses from student questionnaires or the views of academic staff. **[A72; M10]** New programme developments are initiated by market research, for example for the master's programme in business and administration. **[A25]** This is a comprehensive document which covers, for example, the labour market and employment opportunities, the business case and the need for additional resources. **[Chapter I Standard I.7]**

3.9 The link with external stakeholders for curriculum development on an ongoing basis is less well defined. **[M7]** The review team met with a group of influential dignitaries including the Deputy Mayor of Tirana, representatives from major employers in the region and a number of alumni. **[M7]** They were all very supportive of the Institution and the programmes offered but stated that there was no formal mechanism for them to provide input into curriculum development. Currently they informally discuss programme developments with known lecturers but could give no examples of how this had influenced curriculum development. **[M7]** The review team considers the lack of formal input into curriculum development by external stakeholders to be a **weakness**. The team **recommends** that as a matter of urgency, the University establishes a consistent arrangement for securing input from external stakeholders on curriculum development to ensure that the curriculum continues to align with employment needs for students. **[Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12]**

3.10 The Institution states that all programmes have as a primary objective the promotion of critical thinking and constructive debate, with the aim of democratically developing students and making them citizens who can meet market job requirements, are good citizens to serve the society, and are able to contribute to the economy and overall development of the country. **[SER p27]** First-cycle bachelor's programmes provide students with basic knowledge and general scientific principles which enable either progression to second-cycle master's programmes or into employment, which is supported by professional practice. **[SER p.31-32; A67; Web docs 1-3]** Second-cycle programmes have an increasing research base and are fully supported by employers and other external stakeholders. **[SER p.32; M7]** Alumni are appreciative of the theoretical principles learnt and how these prepared them for employment. **[M7]** **[Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.8; Chapter I Standard I.9; Chapter I Standard I.11]**

3.11 The Institution compiles limited statistical data on the employment of graduates by programme, for example employment status, salaries and satisfaction with the programme. **[SER p.32; B18]** Generally, feedback on programme satisfaction was good, ranging from 75 per cent to 96 per cent. **[B18]** The employment rates were less so, ranging from 44 per cent

to 54 per cent in relevant employment. Statistical data on employment does not appear to be available on the Institution website. [**Chapter I Standard I.9**]

3.12 Learning foreign languages is part of the curricula for all levels of study. [**SER p.33**] Students stated that one subject in Year 1 and one in Year 2 are taught in English but no other foreign languages were mentioned. [**M6**] However, staff indicated that subjects are not taught in English but a part-time lecturer indicated that his background and English language ability enabled students to be introduced to English business terms. [**M10**] The majority of staff met by the review team could not converse in English and the students demonstrated a higher level of English language skills than the staff. On successful completion of their programme of study students receive a diploma and a diploma supplement which details the subjects, level and credits awarded. [**M2-M6; M10; M11**] [**Chapter I Standard I.10**]

## Findings

### Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weakness:

- the lack of formal input into curriculum development by external stakeholders (paragraph 3.9; **Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12**).

### Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendation:

- as a matter of urgency, the University establishes a consistent arrangement for securing input from external stakeholders on curriculum development to ensure that the curriculum continues to align with employment needs for students (paragraph 3.9; **Chapter I Standard I.7; Chapter I Standard I.12**).

### Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

## Judgement

**The Standards for the Curriculum are substantially met.**

## Evaluation Area 4: Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research

4.1 At the beginning of each academic year the Institution ensures the efficient organisation of the study programmes that it offers. Lecture plans and syllabuses are kept and stored in the respective faculties and departments. **[SER p.34-36; A82; M3; M4]** Programmes are initially drafted by a working group and by the respective professors, whose names are included in the respective programme licensing files. In addition, programmes are subject to continuous improvements every semester by the academic staff. **[SER p.34-36; A83; M2-4]** Professional practice takes place at the end of the third year in the bachelor's study programme in institutions approved by the dean's office and under the guidance of the professor in charge of the department. During the professional practice students receive grades, the same as in other subjects. Students are obliged to respect the rules of the Institution during their professional practice, including attendance requirements. **[SER p.34; A7; M6; M10] [Chapter I Standard II.1]**

4.2 Examination rules and the requirements are provided in Institution and programme regulations. **[SER p.36-37; A7; M3; M10]** The examination dates are announced in advance and they are accessible for all members of academic staff and students (website, printed and displayed at the premises of the Institution). **[SER p.36-37; M3; M6; M10]** Anonymity is respected during the correction of examinations and publication of results. **[A85; M6; M11]** Complaints against examination scores are reviewed by a committee set up in compliance with examination regulations. **[SER p.36-37]** The appeal is submitted in writing to the Head of Department within 48 hours of the student being informed about the grade of the exam. If unresolved, the dean of faculty is informed. The dean, within 48 hours of being informed about the complaint by the Head of Department, establishes an ad hoc committee, which investigates the student's claims. With the approval of the dean, the committee assesses the final evaluation for the exam. **[Chapter I Standard II.2]**

4.3 The Institution continually improves the standards and the quality of the study programmes through its structures. **[SER p.39-40; M2-M6; M10; M11]** At the beginning of each academic year all staff are able to update the syllabus, in terms of introducing new topics and proposing new literature (as mentioned in paragraph 4.1). For example, the constitutional changes (July 2016) were accompanied by an updated version of the Constitutional Law curriculum at bachelor's level. **[SER p.37; A82; A83; M10]**. The Internal Quality Assurance Unit is responsible for overseeing the improvement of teaching quality across the Institution. **[SER p.39-40; A10]** The unit organises staff and student questionnaires, joint department meetings and interviews with students to gather information to evaluate the quality of teaching. **[SER p.39-40; A92-A94; M3]**. Students are involved in the evaluation of lecturers and study programme implementation. **[SER p.37; A88; A89; M6]** An analysis of student questionnaires is carried out at the end of each semester by the Internal Quality Assurance Unit. Students indicated that account is given to their feedback; for example, students had complained about the quality of teaching in financial law, which resulted in a change of teaching staff for this subject. **[SER p.37-38; A93; M3; M6] [Chapter I Standard II.3; Chapter I Standard II.4]**

4.4 The Institution indicates that it encourages staff to engage in scientific research and aims to recruit academic staff qualified in scientific research. **[SER p.41-42; M2-M5; M10; M11]** The Institution has also invited a number of foreign lecturers to deliver open lectures to staff and students. Invitations have been accepted by foreign lecturers, and open lessons on the premises of the Institution have been developed, for example the special courses in civil litigation in the framework of agreement between the Institution and an Austrian institution. **[SER p.41; A41; A116; A119; A122; A123; M6; M10]** The outcomes from conferences and staff research activities are published online and in hard copy. **[SER p.42-43; A97; A120;**

**M10] [Chapter II Standard I.2; Chapter II Standard I.5; Chapter II Standard I.6; Chapter II Standard I.7; Chapter II Standard I.8]**

4.5 It is acknowledged that, as a relatively new institution starting out in scientific research, continuity in the scientific research field, and information on transfer of results in the field of scientific research, was not readily available. Meetings with members of Senate and academic staff did not identify institutional scientific research priorities. **[M4; M5; M10]** The Institution does encourage the development and dynamism in scientific research but this is manifested only in the various conferences that the Institution has organised, as well as in the publication of the institutional journal 'Periodical Scientific Journal of Wisdom'. **[SER p.43; M3; M10]** However, the Institution does not have a formal research strategy and it is not clear on the processes for developing and agreeing with institutional research priorities. **[SER p.41-43]** The review team identified as a **weakness** the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities. The team **recommends** that as a matter of urgency, the University develops and implements a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities. **[Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5]**

4.6 In accordance with relevant higher education law and the Statute, the relevant department is the main decision-making unit for teaching, learning, assessment and research. However, while there is clear evidence to indicate that this is the case for the teaching, learning and assessment functions, the review team was unable to confirm the role of the department in highlighting its strengths and weaknesses in relation to scientific research. **[SER p.40; A1; M10]** The review team identified as a **weakness** the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments. The team **recommends** that as a matter of urgency, the University takes steps to ensure the promotion, coordination and management of the scientific research work of established research groups. **[Chapter II Standard I.1]**

4.7 The Institution states that the organisation of, and staff attendance at, scientific conferences is the focus of its research internationalisation agenda. **[SER p.41; M2-M5; M10; M11]** While the Institution has signed a number of agreements with foreign higher education institutions with a view to engaging in research activities, there has been no research activity with a partner to date. **[M10]** The review team identified as a **weakness** the absence of research activity with a partner and the lack of engagement with European bids in the field of scientific research. The team **recommends** that the University develops and implements a defined plan to ensure that its research internationalisation agenda has a clear focus on engaging with European bids in the field of scientific research, and on research cooperation with foreign higher education institutions more generally. **[Chapter II Standard I.3]**

## Findings

### Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### Weaknesses

The review team identified the following weaknesses:

- the absence of a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- the absence of specific research priorities, analysis and discussion within departments (paragraph 4.6; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)
- the absence of research activity with a partner, and no engagement with European bids in the field of scientific research (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.3**).

### Recommendations

The review team identified the following recommendations:

- develop and implement a formal research strategy to guide institutional and department research priorities (paragraph 4.5; **Chapter II Standard I.4; Chapter II Standard I.5**)
- ensure that departments take responsibility for promoting, coordinating and managing the scientific research work of established research groups (paragraph 4.6; **Chapter II Standard I.1**)
- develop and implement a defined plan to ensure that its research internationalisation agenda has a clear focus on engaging with European bids in the field of scientific research, and research cooperation with foreign higher education institutions more generally (paragraph 4.7; **Chapter II Standard I.3**).

### Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

### Judgement

**The Standards for Teaching, Learning, Assessment and Research are substantially met.**

## Evaluation Area 5: Students and their Support

5.1 The Institution undertakes information campaigns regarding the career development of the final year high school students in Tirana and other cities. [SER p.44] High school students are provided with information on the Institution, study programmes and the admission criteria. Furthermore, in collaboration with the Regional Educational Directorates, orientation days on career choices for the high school students are arranged. [SER p.44; M4] The Institution has appropriate policies to welcome and integrate new students. [B31] Admission criteria for academic year 2017-18 have been approved by Senate based on average high school grades, average subject-specific grades and an interview. [SER p.44; A107; M4] The ratio of students to staff meets statutory requirements. [SER p.44; M4; M6; M10] [Chapter I Standard III.1]

5.2 The Institution has an effective structure for providing information to and counselling for students. [SER p.44-45; B32] Meetings between students and lecturers are timetabled twice annually, in the first and second semester of the academic year. The Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office follows and supports the academic and professional performance of the students, including information on placement or employment opportunities with partner institutions, professional training, youth forums, and possible applications for national, regional and international conferences. [SER p.44-45; A117; M3; M6] The Institution provides a Student Guide booklet each academic year, which is accessible in the library and online. The guide provides a general overview of the main services offered by the Institution. [SER p.44-45; A71; M3; M6] Administrative staff, principally in the Secretary's Office and the Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office, provide additional support to students either by email or directly. [SER p.45; A55; A107; M6; M11] Student personal files contain the electronic address, phone number and the phone number of a member of the student's family and are held securely in the Secretary's Office. [SER p.45; A108; M11] [Chapter I Standard III.2; Chapter I Standard III.3]

5.3 The Institution promotes, and has supporting policies in place, for sports activity involving students. [SER p.46; M6] Students in specific social categories, or who are beneficiaries of social grants or in financial difficulties, are eligible for a scholarship to reduce tuition fees in first-cycle bachelor's programmes. Scholarships providing access to reduced fees are also available to high performing students and to families with more than three children or with difficulties. [SER p.46; A73; A109; M6; M11] [Chapter I Standard III.4]

5.4 As noted in paragraph 2.11, the review team considers the lack of hard copy books in the library to be a **weakness**. The Institution has a small library, which provides library materials and free services to students, academic and administrative staff. In addition, students and staff have access to an online library. [SER p.46; Learning resource tour] Academic staff and departments develop detailed plans for adding items to the library in support of the study programmes, on an annual basis. [SER p.47; M6; M10] The library fund has also been enriched by donations from individual staff, students and research associates, as well as from organisations. [SER p.47; M10] Library opening times are published on notice boards (Monday to Friday, 09.00-19.30). Students and staff are provided with a registration card to obtain and borrow books. [SER p.46; A111; Learning resource tour] [Chapter I Standard III.5]

5.5 The Institution offers students guidance, counselling and care through a system of mentors and academic advisors appointed by deans of faculty. [SER p.47; A112; B32; M6; M10] Bachelor's students choose a thesis topic from a list provided by the faculty, or they can propose their own topic through the Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office, which then seeks approval from the relevant dean. [SER p.47; M6; M10] Students are provided with advice and support on relevant literature, which is approved by the respective

department and is generally available in the library. [SER p.47; A1; M4; M10] In order to help students who are employed, second-cycle master's programmes schedule lectures during the afternoon. [SER p.47; A124; M6; M10] [Chapter I Standard III.6]

5.6 Students are represented on institutional governing bodies by elected members of the Student Council. [SER p.48; A113; M3; M6] Departments and faculties organise periodic meetings with student representatives to enable students to provide feedback on any aspect of the student experience. [SER p.48; M3; M6] The Institution provides financial support to activities and clubs organised by the Student Council, particularly student orientation and sporting activities. [SER p.48-49; M6] [Chapter I Standard III.8]

5.7 The Institution has implemented policies to assist students in gaining employment. [SER; A49-51; M7] The Human Resources, Careers and Student Life Office maintains regular contact with the partner institutions and human resources departments of public and private institutions. The office retains electronic records of students' professional progress, including information on actual and potential employment of students and graduates. [SER 49; A51; M11] The office updates students with information on opportunities offered by the labour market, aligned with each study profile [SER p.50; M11] The office has also organised activities to keep students in contact with the labour market, for example on-campus presentations by different companies that provide employment opportunities, and internships and open lectures designed to prepare students for the labour market. [A118-A121; M6; M7] [Chapter I Standard III.9]

## Findings

### Good practice

The review team did not identify any features of good practice.

### Weaknesses

The review team did not identify any weaknesses.

### Recommendations

The review team did not identify any recommendations.

### Affirmation of action being taken

The review team did not affirm any actions already in progress.

## Judgement

The Standards for Students and their Support are fully met.



## Evidence list

### List 1

These documents were submitted by the University to accompany the self-evaluation report. There are 145 documents listed. The documents are also listed on pages 54-58 of the self-evaluation report but in this case there are 134 documents listed which is reflected in this list. These documents are referred to in the report as **A1**, **A2**, etc.

- A1 Statute of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A2 Decision no.7, Dated. 17.11.2016, 'On the establishment of the IEC for the Institutional Accreditation'.
- A3 Working plan of the IET for the institutional accreditation of the NPIHE 'Wisdom University'.
- A4 Council of Ministers Decision No. 672, dated 27.9.2006 'On permission to open the non public institution of higher education 'Wisdom College'.
- A5 Council of Accreditation Decision of PAAHE together with the Order of the Minister of Education and Science for the bachelor study programs in Law and Psychology.
- A6 Council of Accreditation Decision of PAAHE together with the Order of the Minister of Education and Science for the master study programs.
- A7 Council of Accreditation Decision of PAAHE No.214, dated 29.07.2011
- A8 Minister of Education and Science Order, No. 412, dated 25.08.2011.
- A9 Order of the MES No.237, Dated. 09.05.2016 'To meet the conditions for institutional accreditation of the non public institution of higher education 'Wisdom College' established by Order no. 355 Dated 25.09.2015 'On conditional accreditation at the institutional level of NPIHE 'University College 'Wisdom'. The recommendation of the Accreditation Council for the removal of the condition for the above accreditation dated 02/18/2016.
- A10 Regulation of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A11 Decision no.1 dated.2.10.2011 of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College' Senate.
- A12 Article 7-11, Regulation on the organization and the functioning of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College' Senate.
- A13 Decision no. 8 Dated. 15.10.2015 of the Academic Senate, 'On approval of the Ethics Council'.
- A14 Ethics Code approved by decision no.10 dated 15.10.2015 of the Academic Senate.
- A15 Composition of the Senate, Decision on the appointment of the Academic Senate of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A16 Decision on the appointment of the IQAU of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A17 Regulation on the functioning of the IQAU of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A18 5-year strategic development plan of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College' for the years 2012- 2017.
- A19 Work plan of the IQAU for the academic year 2016-2017.
- A20 Strategic plan of Quality 2016-2018 for the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A21 Decision on the establishment of the institution.
- A22 Instruction no.11 Dated.28.02.2011 'Procedures and Documents required to open a private institution of higher education, university study programs for the first cycle and the second cycle, non university study programs, professional ones, and the procedures for suspension and revocation of the license', Chapter IV.B. See the Appendix: Organization and Management. Section.23.
- A23 Letter no. 149 Prot, Dated. 04.10.2016, on the delivery of the report to the Ministry of Education.
- A24 Academic staff (Qualifications and the respective titles) in the departments of the two faculties in the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'. Article 14 Code of Ethics and article 4 of the Regulation of the Faculty Council.

- A25 A market study by the Department of the Economics, Section: 'Labor Market on Economy profession'
- A26 A study market on the study program on the Law Faculty.
- A27 A study market on the bachelor and Master of Science study program on Psychology.
- A28 Regulation on the Science and Foreign Affairs Units.
- A29 Activity Plan of the Science and foreign Relation Units, 2016-2017.
- A30 Subscription in the law journal.
- A31 Project 'Meeting the Alumni' at the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A32 Mission and the Scope of the Foundation Act of the RDIW.
- A33 Application list of the RDIW in national and international projects and the respective website.
- A34 Declaration of Commitment and the Registration on the European Commissioner page.
- A35 Agreement with the MBS College of Crete.
- A36 Agenda of the Scientific International Conference with the European Institute regarding the Management, Law and Diplomacy.
- A37 Agreements with public and private agencies for the students' internships.
- A38 List of cooperation agreement in a national and international level. (summary table).
- A39 Invitation by the CILS for the staff participation, 2 calls, call for application from Teramos. Photo.
- A40 Alumni Letter by CILS for the American professors at the institution.
- A41 Agenda of the lectures by American professors.
- A42 Letter Alumni by CILS for the coming professor in the institution J.D. Andrew Nea.
- A43 A summary and additional documents from an Open Lecture, of the British Lecturer Andy Zdan Michajlowitz.
- A44 Proposals of the Department and the Decisions of the Science Unit on the organization of the Open Lectures by the invited lecturers. (the procedure, how it evolves).
- A45 Practice of the academic staff recruitment of the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A46 The complete list of the academic staff of the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'
- A47 The complete list of the publishing activity of the academic staff of the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'
- A48 A sample of the job contract of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A49 Organigram of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A50 Calendar of Activities of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A51 Employment statistics of the academic staff of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A52 Sample of the Self Evaluation Report of the academic staff of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A53 Calendar of the Internal Quality Control of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A54 Sample of the Internal Quality Control of the Teaching and Measurements Performance of lecturers, of the First Semester for the academic year 2016-2017.
- A55 Regulation of the Human Resources, Career and Student Life Office of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A56 Sample of the Personnel file.
- A57 Decision on the appointment of the Chancellor of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A58 Data from the Finance office.
- A59 Report of the Finance Office.
- A60 Photo of the lecture halls of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A61 Photo of the Library of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A62 Photo of the Academic staff office of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A63 Floorplans and rental contracts of buildings, attached to the report.
- A64 Publishing of the WISDOM Press.

- A65 Format of a scientific article review së një artikulli shkencor.
- A66 Data on the environment of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College', used by the academic staff and for the academic activities
- A67 List of the cooperation agreement which help in the internship practice
- A68 Job contract of the security and cleaning personnel
- A69 IT of the institution, Mr. Ardian Sinani.
- A70 List of the study programs offered by the NPIHE 'Wisdom College', with the respective data on the licensing and the accreditation.
- A71 Students Guide manual of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A72 A sample of the students questionnaire on the ' Assessment of the teaching and the learning process' at the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'
- A73 Letter/protocol on granting a scholarship for the excellent students.
- A74 Instruction No. 52, date 03.12.2015 'On the assessment of the level of the foreign languages and the international tests for the admission in the study programs of the second and the third cycle in the Higher Education Institution'.
- A75 Annual Plan of the Curriculum office for the academic year 2016 - 2017
- A76 Instruction No.20, dated 09.05.2008 ' On the activity of the academic staff at the Public Institution of Higher Education HEI'
- A77 Sample of the Syllabus on the subject of 'Operational Management', for the study program ' Business Management' of the first study cycle bachelor
- A78 Regulation 'On the organization and the functioning of the Curricula Office of the 'Wisdom College'
- A79 Instruction No. 4 dated 22.1.2008, No. 14 dated 3.4.2008, and No. 15 dated 4.4.2008 of the MES
- A80 Regulation on the Registration and Study transfer on the study programs of the NPIHE for the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of the Economics and Social Sciences of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A81 Sample of the transfer file procedures for the Faculty of Law & the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences of the NPIHE ' Wisdom College'.
- A82 Procedures of teaching plans approval for the offered study programs.
- A83 Procedures of approval for the subject programs.
- A84 Regulation on the function of the Library of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A85 Agreement of the NPIHE 'Wisdom College' with Proquest.
- A86 Approval of the Structure for the academic year, the procedure.
- A87 Procedure of a complaint filed by the student.
- A88 Sample of amendment of a syllabus. Procedures.
- A89 Sample of improvement of the syllabus. Sample of a syllabus of the subject: International Marketing'
- A90 Composition of the Units which include students as well. Decisions of the appointments.
- A91 Working Plan of the Human Resources, Career and Student life Office in the NPIHE 'Wisdom College' for the academic year 2016-2017.
- A92 Sample of the academic staff questionnaire and a completed one.
- A93 A summary of the joint meetings of the departments and the respective faculties, and the students
- A94 A report submitted to the Rector of the NPIHE regarding the term reports of the academic staff on the subject they teach and a sample of a completed one.
- A95 A copy of the form for the report on the scientific research activity of the academic staff for the academic year 2016 - 2017
- A96 Administrator's decision No.1.Prot dated 12.01.2017 where it is provided the funding for the support of the scientific activities (permanent realization of scientific publications, seminars and other scientific conferences, the movement of the academic staff members, etc., for the academic year 2016-2017).
- A97 Publication of the William Polk in the Conference Proceeding Book.
- A98 Agenda of the activity 'Workshop on Smart Specialization and Innovation, TAIEX'.

- A99 Photos from the activity INFO DAY on the European programs of the scientific research and innovation.
- A100 Photos of the seminars of the activity 'Info Day' HORIZONS 2020, organized by AKTI and the RDIW
- A101 Letter from the Human Resources on the part time staff employed in the other institutions and their job position.
- A102 Annual Activity Plan of the departments.
- A103 Supporting materials like: agenda, invitation cards, brochures on the scientific events at the institution.
- A104 Publications of the students in the Institutions Publication and the students seminar agenda
- A105 Conference Proceeding Books, ISBN.
- A106 The procedures pursued by our institution regarding the approval of the first study cycle in accordance with article no.74, section
- A107 Admission in the first study cycle in accordance with the Law no. 80/2015 'On the Higher Education and Scientific Research in Higher Education Institutions in the Republic of Albania'. 2. Regulation of the Secretariat. Article about the communication with the students.
- A108 A sample of the personal file of a student.
- A109 Procedure of granting a scholarship. Scholarship papers which are granted over the years.
- A110 Law No.9154, dated 06.11.2003 'On Archives '.
- A111 Sample of the registration card at the library of NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A112 List of the mentors for the Faculty of Law and Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences for the academic year 2016-2017.
- A113 The report of the Human Resources and Career and Student Life Office No. 61.Prot. dated 08/11/2016 for the reorganization of Student clubs and Student Government elections.
- A114 Report of the IQAU on the completion of the questionnaire for the first semester of the 2016 - 2017 academic year.
- A115 A collaboration agreement in order to ensure the sportive infrastructure.
- A116 A sample of conferences, open lectures, seminars, a series of periodic discussions and debates, student projects in partnership etc. In order to evidence the students engagement at the NPIHE 'Wisdom College'.
- A117 Report on the activities and the progress of the Human Resources, Career and Student Life Office, 'Who hired graduate students from the NPIHE' University College Wisdom'
- A118 'University' with open doors. Supporting materials on this activity.
- A119 Invitations to meetings and discussions with personalities within the country but also ambassadors.
- A120 European Week, 4-9 May 2017 Skopje, Macedonia. See the Appendix: Students and their support. Section.29.
- A121 Introduction of different companies which offer work opportunities and internships.
- A122 Supporting documents for the Open lecture titled: ' First steps to a successful career' organized on the 10.04.2017 by the Human Resources, Career and Student Life Office
- A123 Supporting materials on the Open Lecture titled: 'Youth Employment in Albania, challenges, and difficulties' held by the invited guest Mr. Neshat Zeneli, a representative of the Employment National Service.
- A124 Lessons/classes for the study program Master of Science and Professional Master are held in the afternoon in order to help the students who are employed.
- A125 Regulatory of the Faculty of 'Economic and Social Sciences'.
- A126 Economy Department Regulatory
- A127 Regulatory of the Studies Bachelor in 'Business-Management'
- A128 Regulatory of the Studies Bachelor in 'Finance-Bank '

- A129 Psychology Department Regulatory
- A130 Regulatory of the Studies Bachelor in 'Law'
- A131 Regulatory of 'Master of Science' Studies in 'Civil and Commercial Law'
- A132 Regulatory of 'Master of Science' Studies in 'Criminal Law'
- A133 Public Law Department Regulatory
- A134 Private Law Department Regulatory

The following documents appear on the website but are not listed in the self-evaluation report. These are referred to as **Web doc 1**, **Web doc 2**, etc

1. File of the syllabuses Bachelor in Law
2. File of the syllabuses Bachelor in Psychology
3. File of the syllabuses Bachelor in Economics

## List 2

These documents were submitted by the University following a request from the review team for clarification of the original supporting documents. These documents are referred to in the report as **B1**, **B2**, etc.

- B1 Evaluation Area 1 The organisation and its management Point 1. Evidence of amendments made to statute and regulations.pdf
- B2 Area 1 Point 1 Faculty Council.pdf
- B3 Area 1 point 2 The Board.pdf
- B4 Area 1 point 2 The Senate.pdf
- B5 Area1 point2 The Rectorate.pdf
- B6 Area 1 Point 2 Council of Ethics.pdf
- B7 Area 1 Point 2 Scientific and foreign affairs unit.pdf
- B8 Area 1 Point 3 Evidence of clear separation of activity between administrative and academic management body.pdf
- B9 Area 1 point 4 Organization Chart.pdf
- B10 Area1 point 5 Mechanism for monitoring effectiveness of implementation of decisions made.pdf
- B11 Area 1 Point 6 Clarify the role of the Research and Development Institute Wisdom and the relationship with the University.pdf
- B12 Area 1 Point 7 Copy of the 2015-16 annual report.pdf
- B13 Area 1 Point 8 Copy of the OSRFR annual activity plan.pdf
- B14 Area 1 point 9 Evidence to demonstrate that new programme development takes account of the needs of local economy and labour market.pdf
- B15 Area 2 Point 10 Clarify the process for ensuring that the University has appropriately qualified and experienced staff to teach on the programmes.pdf
- B16 Area 2 Point 11 Information on the process of evaluating staff skills.pdf
- B17 Evaluation Area 2 Point 12Information on the process of drafting the budget and for budget monitoring and control.pdf
- B18 Area 3 Point 13 Summary of graduate destinations by programme.pdf
- B19 Area 3 Point 14 A sample of collated results from student questionnaires.pdf
- B20 Area 3 Point 15 The Complaints Procedure and the Appeals Procedure provided to students.pdf
- B21 Area 3 Point 16 Examples of all other information provided to students.pdf
- B22 Area 3. Point 17 Examples of matters addressed by the Quality Assurance unit.pdf
- B23 Area 4 Point 18 Data to demonstrate that the Institution respects and preserves confidentiality of students personal exam scores.pdf
- B24 Area 4 Point 19 Examples of the process to upgrade programmes, including the involvement of students.pdf
- B25 Area 4 Point 20 Clarify the process for publishing the outcomes of examinations and competitions are published.pdf

- B26 Area 4 Point 21 Examples of student employment data.pdf
- B27 Area 4 Point 22 Clarify the mechanisms that measure teaching quality.pdf
- B28 Area 4. Point 23. Clarify the University's scientific research priorities.pdf
- B29 Area 4 Point 24 Information on the policy for research culture promotion at a regional and national level.pdf
- B30 Area 5 point 25 Information on midterm development projects designed in accordance with students' admission policies.pdf
- B31 Area 5 Point 26 Information on specific policies for absorption and integration of new students and the policy for welcoming foreign students.pdf
- B32 Area 5 Point 27 Clarify the structures for guiding and advising students during all cycles of study.pdf
- B33 area 5 point 28 Information on promotion and support for sporting activities.pdf
- B34 Area 5 Point 29 Examples of support and finance provided for student council activities and cultural life.pdf
- B35 Area 5 point 30 Information and examples of policy on favouring employment of graduates.pdf

### List 3

These documents were submitted by the University following a request from the review team during the review visit. These documents are referred to in the report as **C1**, **C2**, etc.

- C1 Action Plan of the Self Evaluation Group.PDF
- C2 action plan of OSFR.PDF
- C3 Information on the process of improving the study program (1).pdf
- C4 Plani strategjik i zhvillimit 2012-2017.PDF
- C5 Regulation of OSFR.pdf
- C6 Statistics of the students graduated for Wisdom College.pdf
- C7 strategic plan 2012 - 2017.PDF
- C8 Technical Report on the building.pdf
- C9 Study Market on Psychology.PDF
- C10 The Agenda with the respective names for each respective meeting pdf.pdf
- C11 documents regarding the removal of suspension and the fulfilled criteria.pdf

### Meetings held during the visit

Meetings are referred to throughout the report using the following abbreviations:

#### Day 1: Thursday 15 June 2017

- 08:45 - 09:00 **M1:** Meeting with Institutional Coordinator.
- 09:00 - 09:30 **M2:** Meeting with the Rector.
- 10:00 - 11:00 **M3:** Meeting with the Self-evaluation Team.
- 11:30 - 12:30 **M4:** Meeting with all members of the Academic Senate (excluding the Rector).
- 13:30 - 14:30 **M5:** Meeting with all members of the Rectorate and Board (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).
- 15:00 - 16:00 **M6:** Meeting with a group of students.
- 16:30 - 17:30 **M7:** Meeting with a sample of external partners and alumni.
- 18:00 - 18:15 **M8:** Meeting with Institutional Coordinator to clarify any matters arising during Day 1.

#### Day 2: Friday 16 June 2017

- 09:00 - 09:30 **M9:** Meeting with the Institutional Coordinator to clarify any matters arising.

- 09:30 - 10:30 **M10:** Meeting with a group of teaching staff (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).
- 11:00 - 12:00 **M11:** Meeting with a group of administrative staff (excluding any individuals already met by the review team).